

**MINUTES OF THE
INTERVIEWS AND FINAL CMAR SELECTION**

**New Nursing Building
Nicholls State University
Thibodaux, Louisiana
Project No. 19-621-22-01, F.19002436**

A meeting of the selection committee to conduct interviews and make the final selection for the project referenced above was held in the Claiborne Building, 1201 N. Third Street, 1-136C Thomas Jefferson Room, Baton Rouge, Louisiana 70802 on Tuesday, December 05, 2023.

The meeting was called to order at 8:05 a.m. by Bobby Boudreaux, CMAR Coordinator. Those committee members present were Chip Verges, Nick Moldaner, David Van Alstine, David Poche, Danielle Breaux

The first item of business was to ask for any public comments. There were none.

The next item of business was to enter executive session for interviews. There was a roll call vote and all committee members agreed to enter executive session.

Presentations during the executive session were as follows:

8:15 a.m. – 9:00 a.m.	Arkel Constructors, LLC
9:15 a.m. – 10:00 a.m.	DonahueFavret Contractors, Inc.
10:15 a.m. – 11:00 a.m.	Broadmoor, LLC

The committee reconvened at 11:45 a.m. Those committee members present were: Chip Verges, Nick Moldaner, David Van Alstine, David Poche, Danielle Breaux. There was a roll call vote and all committee members agreed to exit executive session.

Mr. Boudreaux explained the scoring and ranking of applicants, outlining the following:

The purpose of this meeting is to score the applicants to determine who the committee will recommend for award for the Part A: Pre-Construction Services contract. Ballots were provided to each committee member for the purpose of ranking each Proposal 1st, 2nd or 3rd for four different evaluation and selection criteria. The following scores are assigned to each rank: 1st = 3 points, 2nd = 2 points and 3rd = 1 point. Scoring will be in descending order with the highest total score representing the best score.

The first evaluation and selection criteria outlined in Tab 1 of the RFQ is History, Organization, Financial Condition of Proposer, which includes:

- Business organization and history of the Proposer
- Organization structure
- Financial condition

Mr. Boudreaux requested that Danielle Breaux, user agency representative, please share her recommendations for this selection criteria. He requested recommendations from other committee members. David Van Alstine and David Poche shared their recommendations as well.

Mr. Boudreaux requested that committee members complete their ranking on this evaluation and selection criteria on their ballots.

Mr. Boudreaux explained that the second evaluation and selection criteria that was outlined in Tab 2 of the RFQ is Qualifications & Staffing Plan, which includes:

- Pre-Construction Program
- Experience of key personnel including proposed partners and others proposed in key roles for the project.
- Relationships with the sub-contractor market

- Pre-construction phase staffing plans
- Construction phase staffing plans

Mr. Boudreaux requested that Danielle Breaux, user agency representative, please share her recommendations for this selection criteria. He requested recommendations from other committee members. David Van Alstine and David Poche shared their recommendations as well.

Mr. Boudreaux requested that committee members complete their ranking on this evaluation and selection criteria on their ballots.

Mr. Boudreaux explained that the third evaluation and selection criteria that was outlined in Tab 3 of the RFQ is Approach & Methodology, which includes:

- Management approach
- Project organization
- Expectation of being able to propose and meet an acceptable GMP on time that meets the Owner's expectations
- Unique capabilities/resources
- Proposed strategy to maximize DBE, SE, and/or Veteran-Owned Firms participation on this Project
- Safety program

Mr. Boudreaux requested that Danielle Breaux, user agency representative, please share her recommendations for this selection criteria. He requested recommendations from other committee members. David Van Alstine and David Poche shared their recommendations as well.

Mr. Boudreaux requested that committee members complete their ranking on this evaluation and selection criteria on their ballots.

Mr. Boudreaux explained that the fourth and final evaluation and selection criteria that was outlined in Tab 4 of the RFQ is Past Performance and Experience on Similar Projects, which includes:

- Pre-construction and construction experience of Proposer and its Management Team on similar projects with comparable scale and complexity.
- Experience with innovative delivery and procurement strategies
- Experience in proposing innovative design alterations that preserve quality at less cost
- History of previous professional relationship(s) between proposed team members, the Architect, and the Owner
- Demonstration of ability to provide well integrated, team approach to pre-construction services on past projects
- Satisfaction on similar projects verified with past employers/customers.
- Past performance of DBE, SE and/or Veteran-Owned Firms participation on similar projects
- Safety record

Mr. Boudreaux requested that Danielle Breaux, user agency representative, please share her recommendations for this selection criteria. He requested recommendations from other committee members. David Van Alstine and David Poche shared their recommendations as well.

Mr. Boudreaux requested that committee members complete their ranking on this evaluation and selection criteria on their ballots.

Mr. Boudreaux collected the ballots and read the rankings aloud. The rankings were recorded, scored and totaled to derive a total score for each Proposer. The following scores are assigned to each rank: 1st = 3 points, 2nd = 2 points and 3rd = 1 point. Scoring is descending order with the highest total score representing the best score.

The following scores were recorded.

History, Organization, Financial Condition of Proposer

	Chip Verges	Nick Moldaner	David Van Alstine	David Poche	Danielle Breaux	Total
Arkel Constructors, LLC	1	1	1	1	2	6
DonahueFavret Contractors, Inc.	3	3	3	2	3	14
Broadmoor, LLC	2	2	2	3	1	10

Qualifications and Staffing Plan

	Chip Verges	Nick Moldaner	David Van Alstine	David Poche	Danielle Breaux	Total
Arkel Constructors, LLC	1	3	3	2	3	12
DonahueFavret Contractors, Inc.	2	1	1	3	2	9
Broadmoor, LLC	3	2	2	1	1	9

Approach and Methodology

	Chip Verges	Nick Moldaner	David Van Alstine	David Poche	Danielle Breaux	Total
Arkel Constructors, LLC	1	1	1	1	3	7
DonahueFavret Contractors, Inc.	3	2	2	3	1	11
Broadmoor, LLC	2	3	3	2	2	12

Past Performance and Experience on Similar Projects

	Chip Verges	Nick Moldaner	David Van Alstine	David Poche	Danielle Breaux	Total
Arkel Constructors, LLC	1	2	1	2	3	9
DonahueFavret Contractors, Inc.	3	3	3	3	2	14
Broadmoor, LLC	2	1	2	1	1	7

TOTAL SCORES

	History, Organization, Financial Condition of Proposer	Qualifications and Staffing Plan	Approach and Methodology	Past Performance and Experience on Similar Projects	Total
Arkel Constructors, LLC	6	12	7	9	34
DonahueFavret Contractors, Inc.	14	9	11	14	48
Broadmoor, LLC	10	9	12	7	38

DonahueFavret Contractors, Inc. will be recommended in writing to the owner by the selection review committee for the Part A: Pre-Construction Services contract award.

Meeting was adjourned at 12:05 p.m.